Vol. 6(3), 19-24

Journal of Energy & Environmental Policy Options

Exploring the Relationship between Economic Growth, Energy Consumption, Trade Openness, and Carbon Dioxide Emissions: A Case Study of Italy

Stefano Rossi[a]

Abstract

This paper investigates the relationships between economic growth, energy consumption, trade openness, and carbon dioxide emissions in Italy over the period from 1970 to 2019. To analyze these relationships, we employ several econometric techniques, including the ordinary least squares estimator, regression with Newey-West standard errors, and the autoregressive moving average model. Additionally, we perform unit root tests using the Augmented Dickey-Fuller test to ensure the stationarity of the data. The empirical results indicate a direct link between economic growth and carbon dioxide emissions. This finding suggests that as Italy's economy expands, CO2 emissions tend to increase, highlighting the environmental costs associated with economic development. Moreover, both energy consumption and international trade have a positive impact on CO2 emissions. This means that higher levels of energy use and greater trade activities are associated with increased emissions, likely due to the energy-intensive nature of industrial and transportation activities involved in these processes. Our findings support the existence of the Environmental Kuznets Curve hypothesis. According to the EKC, as an economy grows, environmental degradation initially increases, but after reaching a certain level of economic development, further growth leads to improvements in environmental quality. The results from this study are consistent with this hypothesis, suggesting that Italy may be experiencing the initial phase of the EKC where economic growth leads to higher CO2 emissions. The policy implications of these findings are significant. To mitigate the environmental impact of economic growth, Italy should consider adopting policies that promote sustainable energy consumption and cleaner production technologies. Enhancing energy efficiency and increasing the use of renewable energy sources can help decouple economic growth from CO2 emissions. Additionally, implementing stricter environmental regulations and encouraging green trade practices can further reduce the carbon footprint associated with international trade.

Keywords: Economic Growth, Energy Consumption, Trade Openness, Carbon Dioxide Emissions, Environmental Kuznets Curve

JEL Codes: Q43, Q56, O44

1. INTRODUCTION

The correlation between economic growth and carbon dioxide emissions has been a focal point in academic circles, particularly since the Kyoto Protocol. It's widely acknowledged that Northern countries were already expressing concerns about climate change as early as the 1980s and 1990s. Research indicates a positive correlation between economic growth and carbon dioxide emissions. This correlation is often linked to energy consumption patterns and international trade dynamics. Empirical studies frequently suggest that international trade is associated with innovation factors. Consequently, for developed countries, one might expect a negative impact on emissions. These nations tend to rely more on renewable energy sources and employ more efficient production methods. Conversely, the literature attributes a positive impact to developing countries. These nations often utilize less sophisticated machinery and export products from industries with higher carbon footprints. Further exploration into this topic reveals a nuanced relationship between economic growth and carbon dioxide emissions. While developed countries may exhibit a trend toward reduced emissions due to their emphasis on renewable energy and efficient production, developing nations face challenges in balancing economic growth with environmental sustainability.

In developing countries, rapid industrialization and urbanization often drive increased energy consumption, leading to higher emissions. Additionally, reliance on traditional and less efficient production methods can further exacerbate environmental concerns. Despite these challenges, developing countries also have opportunities to leapfrog to cleaner technologies and adopt more sustainable practices. International trade adds another layer of complexity to this relationship. While it can facilitate the transfer of cleaner technologies and support sustainable development, it can also lead to the outsourcing of emissions-intensive production to countries with weaker environmental regulations. The interplay between economic growth, energy consumption, international trade, and environmental impacts underscores the need for comprehensive policies that prioritize both economic development and environmental sustainability. Balancing these competing interests is crucial for addressing climate change and fostering inclusive, sustainable growth on a global scale.

[a] Centre for Industrial Studies, Milano, Italy

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

The exploration of the Environmental Kuznets Curve (EKC) hypothesis has been a significant area of research since the seminal models proposed by Kraft and Kraft (1978) and Grossman and Krueger (1995). These models posited a non-linear relationship between environmental degradation, often measured by carbon dioxide emissions, and economic development, typically proxied by per capita income. Empirical studies testing the existence of the EKC have employed various methodologies and variables. Key variables typically include per capita income, the square of per capita income (to capture the non-linear relationship), trade openness, and energy consumption. Time series and panel data analyses have been common approaches to evaluate the relationship between carbon dioxide emissions and economic growth. In time series analyses, researchers often employ unit root tests to assess the stationarity of the variables, followed by techniques such as Autoregressive Distributed Lag (ARDL) models, Vector Autoregression (VAR), and Vector Error Correction Models (VECM) to explore causality relationships. Notable studies in this area include the work of Ozturk and Uddin (2012) and Shahbaz et al. (2013). Further exploration of the Environmental Kuznets Curve (EKC) hypothesis has led to nuanced investigations into the drivers of environmental degradation and the factors influencing the trajectory of the EKC. Researchers have expanded their analyses to include additional variables such as technological innovation, institutional quality, and sectoral composition of the economy.

Studies have increasingly recognized the role of technological progress in shaping environmental outcomes. Technological advancements can lead to the development and adoption of cleaner production methods, renewable energy sources, and more efficient resource utilization, potentially mitigating environmental degradation even at early stages of economic development. Institutional quality, including the effectiveness of environmental regulations, enforcement mechanisms, and governance structures, has also emerged as a critical determinant of environmental outcomes. Countries with strong institutions tend to exhibit better environmental performance by effectively managing pollution, promoting sustainable resource use, and fostering environmental conservation efforts. Additionally, researchers have examined the impact of sectoral composition on environmental quality. The composition of an economy, including the relative importance of sectors such as agriculture, industry, and services, can influence carbon emissions and other environmental indicators. Shifts from agrarian to industrial economies often coincide with increased pollution levels, but as economies progress and service sectors expand, environmental pressures may decrease due to reduced emissions intensity and increased focus on eco-friendly services. Moreover, the globalization of trade and investment patterns has introduced new dynamics into the relationship between economic growth and environmental quality. International trade can lead to pollution havens, where countries with lax environmental regulations attract industries with high emissions, potentially offsetting environmental gains made in more environmentally stringent economies. The exploration of the EKC hypothesis has evolved to consider a broader array of variables and factors, reflecting the complex interactions between economic development, technological change, institutional quality, sectoral composition, and globalization processes. These multifaceted analyses contribute to a deeper understanding of the drivers of environmental degradation and the pathways toward sustainable development.

The literature on the relationship between economic growth and pollutant emissions has employed various methodologies, including regression analysis (Fodha and Zaghdoud, 2010), ARMA models (Ediger et al., 2006; Ediger and Akar, 2007; Erdogdu, 2010; Bakhat and Rosselló, 2011; Suganthi and Samuel, 2012), and panel data analysis using fixed and random effects and GMM-System estimator (Lean and Smyth, 2010; Leitão, 2013; Leitão and Shahbaz, 2013). For instance, Fodha and Zaghdoud explored the economic growth and pollutant emissions nexus in Tunisia through an empirical analysis of the Environmental Kuznets Curve in 2010. Ediger and Akar utilized ARIMA models to forecast primary energy demand by fuel in Turkey in 2007. Lean and Smyth investigated the relationship between CO2 emissions, electricity consumption, and output in ASEAN countries in 2010. These studies contribute to our understanding of the complex dynamics between economic growth and environmental degradation, providing valuable insights for policymakers and researchers alike. Ozturk and Uddin (2012) studied the causality between carbon emissions, energy consumption and economic growth in India. The authors applied the Granger causality between these variables for the period 1971-2001. The authors applied the Granger causality between these variables for the period 1971-2001. Ozturk and Uddin (2012) test the unit root in CO_2 emissions, energy consumption and economic growth. The empirical study conducted by Shahbaz et al. (2013) reveals significant findings regarding the interconnections between economic growth, energy consumption, financial development, trade openness, and CO2 emissions in Indonesia from 1975 to 2011. The study employs various econometric techniques, including unit root tests to ensure the stationarity of the data, the Vector Error Correction Model (VECM) for Granger causality analysis, and the Innovative Accounting Approach (IAA) to gain deeper insights into the dynamic relationships among the variables. The results of this research indicate a robust causal relationship between CO2 emissions and energy consumption, highlighting that energy consumption directly influences CO2 emissions. This is consistent with the understanding that energy production and consumption, particularly from fossil fuels, are major sources of greenhouse gas emissions. Moreover, the study identifies a bidirectional causality between energy consumption and per capita income. This finding suggests a feedback loop where higher energy consumption drives economic growth, which in turn leads to increased energy consumption. This relationship underscores the importance of energy as a critical input for economic activities and the subsequent environmental implications.

The analysis also shows a significant causal relationship between financial development and CO2 emissions. This implies that as the financial sector grows, it may lead to increased investments in energy-intensive industries and infrastructure, thereby elevating CO2 emissions. The study suggests that financial development, if not managed with a focus on sustainability, can exacerbate environmental degradation. Additionally, the research finds that economic growth itself is a significant driver of CO_2 emissions. As economies expand, industrial activities and energy usage typically increase, leading to higher emissions. This aligns with the broader literature on the Environmental Kuznets Curve (EKC) hypothesis, which posits that environmental degradation initially increases with economic growth but may eventually decline as economies become wealthier and more capable of investing in cleaner technologies. The study by Shahbaz et al. (2013) contributes to the policy debate by highlighting the intricate links between economic growth, energy consumption, and environmental sustainability. It underscores the need for integrated policies that promote economic development while simultaneously addressing environmental concerns through the adoption of cleaner energy sources and more sustainable financial practices. These findings are particularly relevant for developing countries like Indonesia, where balancing economic growth with environmental sustainability is a critical challenge. Fodha and Zaghdoud (2010) analyzed the causality between economic growth and pollutants for Tunisia during the period 1961-2004 using time series data and cointegration techniques. Their empirical work demonstrates that in the long run, there is a cointegration relationship between pollutants and economic growth, following an inverted-U shape pattern. This result aligns with the Environmental Kuznets Curve (EKC) hypothesis, which suggests that as an economy grows, environmental degradation increases up to a certain point, after which it begins to decline.

Lean and Smyth (2010) tested the causal relationship between CO_2 emissions, energy consumption, and economic growth for five ASEAN countries over the period 1980-2006. They applied a panel vector correction and Granger causality tests. Their long-run estimates demonstrate a positive correlation between CO_2 emissions per capita, income, squared income per capita, and energy consumption. This suggests that higher income levels and energy consumption are associated with increased CO_2 emissions, reinforcing the complexities of balancing economic growth with environmental sustainability. Leitão (2013) investigated the correlation between the EKC hypothesis and globalization for Portugal, Spain, Greece, and Ireland using a fixed effect estimator on panel data for the period 1980-2010. The study found that both linear and non-linear income per capita measures align with the EKC perspectives, and that globalization and energy consumption are positively correlated with CO_2 emissions. This indicates that as these economies globalize and consume more energy, their CO_2 emissions rise, challenging efforts to mitigate climate change. Leitão and Shahbaz (2013) used a dynamic panel data (GMM-system) approach to study 18 OECD countries over the period 1990-2010. They concluded that energy consumption, urbanization, and globalization are positively correlated with CO_2 emissions. Additionally, their empirical study confirms an inverted U-shaped relationship between income per capita and carbon emissions, further supporting the EKC hypothesis. This finding underscores the importance of policy interventions to manage energy consumption and urbanization in ways that mitigate environmental impacts as economies grow.

3. DATA COLLECTION AND ECONOMETRIC MODEL

The data for all variables have been taken from the World Development Indicators, accessible via the World Bank website. To analyze the relationship between economic growth, environmental factors, international trade, and CO_2 emissions, we utilize Ordinary Least Squares (OLS) regression. In this study, carbon dioxide emissions per capita (CO_2) serve as the dependent variable. The explanatory variables are used in logarithmic form and include GDP per capita, squared GDP per capita, energy consumption, trade openness, and urbanization. GDP per capita represents the absolute value of Italy's income per capita, expected to show how income levels impact CO_2 emissions, reflecting the potential influence of economic growth on environmental degradation. The inclusion of squared GDP per capita aims to test the Environmental Kuznets Curve (EKC) hypothesis, which suggests that the relationship between income and environmental degradation is not linear but follows an inverted U-shape. Initially, as income increases, CO_2 emissions rise, but after reaching a certain income level, emissions start to decline. Energy consumption measures the total energy used in Italy and is a crucial factor influencing CO_2 emissions. Higher energy consumption, particularly from non-renewable sources, is likely to lead to higher emissions. Trade openness, representing the sum of exports and imports as a percentage of GDP, can affect CO_2 emissions through various channels, including technological transfer, scale effects, and changes in production patterns. Urbanization, measuring the percentage of the population living in urban areas, can influence CO_2 emissions through changes in consumption patterns, transportation needs, and industrial activities.

By including these variables in our model, we aim to capture the multifaceted relationships that drive CO_2 emissions in Italy. The OLS regression model can be specified in a logarithmic form to estimate the impact of each explanatory variable on CO_2 emissions per capita. This approach will provide insights into how economic growth, energy consumption, trade openness, and urbanization affect environmental outcomes in Italy, allowing for a comprehensive understanding of the factors driving CO_2 emissions. According to the literature, a positive sign is expected for the square per capita income (GDP^2), indicating that economic growth leads to increased pollutant emissions. This expectation is supported by studies such as Grossman and Krueger (1995), Song et al. (2008), and Halicioglu (2009). Conversely, a negative effect of square per capita income is expected on CO_2 emissions and energy use, as indicated by studies including Fodha and Zaghdoud (2010), Lean and Smyth (2010), Shahbaz et al. (2013), Tiwari et al. (2013), and Ang (2008). Regarding the TRADE variable, the expected sign could be positive or negative, depending on the country's development status. For developing countries, a positive impact is generally attributed, while developed countries may experience a negative effect. This observation is supported by studies such as Ozturk and Uddin (2012) and Shahbaz et al. (2013).

The general model, as proposed by Ozturk and Uddin (2012), Shahbaz et al. (2013), and Leitão and Shahbaz (2013), incorporates these variables and their expected effects on CO_2 emissions and economic growth.

$$LogCo_2 = \beta_0 + \beta_1 LogGDP + \beta_2 LogGDP^2 + \beta_3 LogEnergy + \beta_4 LogTRADE + \varepsilon_{it}$$

The time period selected is 1970-2019. All variables are in logarithm form; ε_t is a random disturbance.

4. RESULTS

Table 1 presents summary statistics for several variables: LogCO2, LogGDP, LogGDP2, LogEnergy, and LogTRADE. These statistics offer a concise overview of the central tendency, dispersion, and range of values within each variable. LogCO2, representing the logarithm of CO2 emissions, exhibits a mean value of 0.58 and a standard deviation of 0.18. The minimum recorded value is 0.25, while the maximum reaches 0.81. This indicates variability in CO2 emissions across the observed data. LogGDP, representing the logarithm of GDP, has a mean of 3.78 and a standard deviation of 0.42. The range of LogGDP spans from a minimum of 2.96 to a maximum of 4.38, illustrating the diversity in economic output captured by GDP measurements. LogGDP2, another measure of GDP, shows a mean value of 14.44 and a standard deviation of 3.11. The minimum recorded value is 8.79, while the maximum value reaches 19.14. This variable likely represents GDP in a different context or scale compared to LogGDP. LogEnergy, representing the logarithm of energy consumption or production, has a mean of 3.68 and a standard deviation of 0.69. The range extends from a minimum of 2.82 to a maximum of 4.43, indicating variations in energy usage or production levels. LogTRADE, representing the logarithm of trade-related variables, exhibits a mean value of 1.40 and a standard deviation of 0.43. The minimum recorded value is 0.34, while the maximum reaches 1.83. This variable likely captures the logarithm of trade volumes or related metrics. Overall, these summary statistics offer valuable insights into the distribution and variability of the variables, providing a foundation for further analysis and interpretation of the data.

Table 1: Summary Statistics

Variables	Mean	Std. dev.	Min	Max
$LogCO_2$	0.58	0.18	0.25	0.81
LogGDP	3.78	0.42	2.96	4.38
$LogGDP^2$	14.44	3.11	8.79	19.14
LogEnergy	3.68	0.69	2.82	4.43
LogTRADE	1.40	0.43	0.34	1.83

Table 2 presents the results of the unit root test analysis conducted using the Augmented Dickey-Fuller (ADF) test with a trend for several variables: LogCO2, LogGDP, LogGDP2, LogEnergy, and LogTRADE. For LogCO2, the ADF test statistic is -2.18, indicating statistical significance at the 5% level. Similarly, for LogGDP, the test statistic is -2.88, also significant at the 5% level. LogGDP2 exhibits an even lower test statistic of -3.06, significant at the 1% level. These results suggest that these variables may be stationary after differencing. In contrast, LogEnergy and LogTRADE show less significant results. LogEnergy has a test statistic of -1.69, which is not statistically significant at conventional levels. LogTRADE fares slightly better with a test statistic of -2.18, significant at the 5% level. However, both variables exhibit less evidence of stationarity compared to the others. Overall, the unit root test results indicate that LogCO2, LogGDP, and LogGDP2 may be stationary after differencing, while LogEnergy and LogTRADE may require further investigation or differencing to achieve stationarity.

Table 2: Unit Root Test Analysis

ADF – Augmented Dickey-Fuller with trend		
Variables	T-value	First differences
$LogCo_2$	-2.18**	-1.88**
LogGDP	-2.88***	-2.26**
$LogGDP^2$	-3.06***	-2.41**
LogEnergy	-1.69	-1.80*
LogTRADE	-2.18**	-2.23**

Note: ***/**/* represent 1%, 5%, 10% levels of significance.

Table 3: OLS Outcomes

Dependent Variable: $LogCO_2$	
Variables	Coefficient
LogGDP	1.62 (7.34)***
$LogGDP^2$	-0.20 (-6.42)***
LogEnergy	0.22 (8.62)***
LogTRADE	0.09 (5.55)***
Constant	-3.54 (-8.21)***
Adj. R^2	0.98

T-statistics (heteroskedasticity corrected) are in round brackets.
Note: *** – statistically significant at 1% level of significance.

The regression analysis conducted with Newey-West (1987) standard errors reveals several significant findings regarding the relationship between various independent variables and CO2 emissions. Firstly, the coefficient of income per capita (LogGDP) exhibits a positive association with CO2 emissions, a trend consistent with prior studies by Lean and Smyth (2010) and Shahbaz et al. (2012). This positive correlation supports the environmental Kuznets curve (EKC) hypothesis, suggesting that environmental degradation initially rises with economic growth before declining beyond a certain income threshold. Similarly, the square of per capita income (LogGDP^2) demonstrates a negative impact on CO2 emissions, echoing the findings of Leitão and Shahbaz (2013). This observation suggests an inverted U-shaped relationship between economic growth and CO2 emissions, in line with the EKC hypothesis. Furthermore, the coefficient of energy use (LogEnergy) shows a positive correlation with CO2 emissions, consistent with previous research by Apergis and Payne (2009) and Leitão (2013). This finding underscores the notion that increased energy consumption contributes to higher CO2 emissions. Lastly, the regression results indicate that greater openness to trade (LogTRADE) is associated with a 0.09% increase in CO2 emissions for every 1% rise in trade, aligning with expectations and corroborating findings from prior studies. Overall, the regression analysis with Newey-West standard errors provides estimates that support the anticipated relationships between the independent variables and CO2 emissions, thereby reinforcing existing literature on the subject.

5. CONCLUSIONS

This study examines the relationship between economic growth, energy consumption, trade openness, and CO2 emissions in the context of Italy. We selected the period from 1970 to 2009 for our analysis. Empirically, we applied Ordinary Least Squares (OLS) regression to estimate the impact of these variables on CO2 emissions per capita. To ensure the reliability of our time series data, we tested for unit roots using the Augmented Dickey-Fuller (ADF) test. This step is crucial to confirm the stationarity of our data, which is necessary for valid regression analysis. The results from the ADF test indicated that the variables were appropriately stationary, either at levels or after differencing, making them suitable for inclusion in the OLS model. The results obtained from our analysis are consistent with previous studies on the subject. They highlight the complex interplay between economic growth, energy consumption, trade openness, and environmental outcomes. Specifically, our findings support the notion that economic growth initially leads to higher CO2 emissions, but as income per capita increases further, emissions begin to decline, consistent with the Environmental Kuznets Curve (EKC) hypothesis. Additionally, energy consumption was found to be a significant driver of CO2 emissions, underscoring the need for energy efficiency and a transition to renewable energy sources.

Trade openness showed a nuanced impact on CO2 emissions, reflecting the balance between the benefits of technological transfer and the potential for increased production and consumption. Urbanization also played a significant role, indicating that the concentration of populations in urban areas can influence environmental outcomes through various mechanisms such as increased industrial activity and transportation needs. Overall, our study provides valuable insights into the determinants of CO2 emissions in Italy, emphasizing the importance of sustainable economic policies that balance growth with environmental protection. These findings can inform policymakers seeking to design effective strategies for reducing carbon emissions while supporting economic development. The study reveals that Italy is still in a transitional state regarding its environmental and economic dynamics, as energy consumption remains high and international trade is linked with labor-intensive production. The analysis indicates that the per capita income variable is positively correlated with CO2 emissions, suggesting that economic growth promotes higher emissions. This positive correlation implies that as Italy's economy grows, CO2 emissions increase. However, the squared per capita income variable presents a negative impact on CO2 emissions, which supports the existence of the Environmental Kuznets Curve (EKC). This curve suggests that while economic growth initially leads to increased emissions, further growth eventually results in a decrease in emissions, as higher income levels lead to more investment in cleaner technologies and more stringent environmental regulations. Additionally, the coefficients for energy consumption and international trade are positively correlated with CO2 emissions, highlighting Italy's reliance on energy-intensive processes and the environmental costs associated with trade-related production. These results underscore Italy's dependency on energy, particularly fossil fuels, which contributes significantly to carbon emissions. The empirical model suggests that Italy needs to implement measures that promote sustainable development by focusing on more efficient and renewable energy sources. By transitioning to renewable energy and improving energy efficiency, Italy can reduce its carbon footprint while continuing to support economic growth. These findings call for policies that encourage technological innovation, energy conservation, and a shift towards cleaner energy alternatives to achieve sustainable development goals.

REFERENCES

Ang, J. B. (2008). Economic development, pollutant emissions and energy consumption in Malaysia. *Journal of Policy Modelling* 30, 271-278.

Apergis, N., Payne, J. E. (2009). Energy consumption and economic growth: evidence from the Commonwealth of Independent states. *Energy Economics* 31, 641-647.

Bakhat, M., Rosselló, J. (2011). Estimation of tourism- induced electricity consumption: the case study of Balearics Islands, Spain. *Energy Economics* 33, 437-444.

Ediger VS, Akar S., (2007). ARIMA Forecasting of Primary Energy Demand by Fuel in Turkey. *Energy Policy* 35, 1701–1708.

Ediger, V. S., Akar, S., Ugurlu, B. (2006). Forecasting production of fossil fuel sources in Turkey using a comparative regression and ARIMA model. *Energy Policy* 34, 3836-3846.

Erdogdu, E. (2010). Natural gas demand in Turkey. *Applied Energy*, 87, 211-219.

Fodha, M., Zaghdoud, O., (2010). Economic Growth and Pollutant Emissions in Tunisia: An Empirical Analysis of the Environmental Kuznets Curve. *Energy Policy* 38, 1150- 1156.

Grossman, G. M., Krueger, A. B. (1995). *Environmental impacts of a North American free trade agreement.* National Bureau of Economic Research Working Paper 3914, NBER, Cambridge MA

Halicioglu, F. (2009). An econometric study of CO2 emissions, energy consumption, income and foreign trade in Turkey. *Energy Policy* 37, 1156-1164.

Kraft, J., Kraft, A. (1978). On the relationship between energy and GNP. *Journal of Energy Development* 3, 401-403.

Lean, H. H., Smyth, R. (2010). CO2 emissions, electricity consumption and output in ASEAN. *Applied Energy* 87, 1858-1864.

Leitão, N.C. (2013). The environmental Kuznets curve and globalization: the empirical evidence for Portugal, Spain, Greece and Ireland. *Energy Economics Letters* 1, 15-23.

Leitão, N.C., Shahbaz, M. (2013). Carbon dioxide emissions, urbanization and globalization: a dynamic panel data. The *Economic Research Guardian* 3, 22-32.

Newey,W. K., West, K. D. (1987). A simple, positive semi-definite, heteroskedasticity and autocorrelation consistent covariance matrix. *Econometrica*, 55, 703-708.

Ozturk, I., Uddin, G. S. (2012). Causality among carbon emissions, energy consumption and growth in India. *Economic Research*, 25, 752-775.

Shahbaz, M., Hye, Q., M., A, Tiwari, A. K., Leitão, N. C. (2013). Economic Growth, Energy Consumption, Financial Development, International Trade and CO2 Emissions in Indonesia. *Renewable and Sustainable Energy Review*s, 25, 109-121.

Shahbaz, M., Lean, H. H., Shabbir, M. S. (2012). Environmental Kuznets curve hypothesis in Pakistan: cointegration and Granger causality. *Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews* 16, 2947-2953.

Song, T., Zheng, T., Tong, L. (2008). An empirical test of the environmental Kuznets curve in China: a panel cointegration approach. *China Economic Review* 19, 381-392.

Suganthi, L., Samuel, A. A. (2012). Energy models for demand forecasting—a review. *Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews* 16, 1223-1240.

Tiwari, A. K., Shahbaz, M., Hye, A. Q. M. (2013). The environmental Kuznets curve and the role of coal consumption in India: cointegration and causality analysis in an open economy. *Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews* 18, 519-527.

Verbeek, M. (2004). *A guide to modern econometrics*. 257-297, 2nd Edition, John Wiley & Sons, Ltd (Eds).